2. What inferences can you draw about the daily relationships between the Spanish rulers and the Indians in the pueblo of Acoma?

3. Compare the testimony of these Indians. How do you explain any contradictions you find? What limitations does this source present to the historian trying to reconstruct the events it claims to describe?

2-2 | “City Upon a Hill” Sermon

JOHN WINTHROP, A Model of Christian Charity (1630)

John Winthrop (1588-1649) was a Puritan lawyer who, like others of his faith, feared God’s punishment for what he regarded as England’s corruption and moral depravity. Hoping to escape the wrath to come and to establish a colony where they would be free from the king’s anti-Puritan policies, Winthrop led some seven hundred migrants to Massachusetts Bay to settle the colony in 1630. Winthrop’s vision for Massachusetts Bay is beautifully expressed in his oft-quoted sermon, A Model of Christian Charity, which he wrote on board the ship Arbella.

Christian Charitie

A Modell Hereof

God Almighty in his most holy and wise providence, hath so disposed of the condition of mankind, as in all times some must be rich, some poor, some high and eminent in power and dignity; others mean and in submission.

The Reason Hereof

1. Reas. First to hold conformity with the rest of his world, being delighted to show forth the glory of his wisdom in the variety and difference of the creatures, and the glory of his power in ordering all these differences for the preservation and good of the whole; and the glory of his greatness, that as it is the glory of princes to have many officers, soe this great king will have many stewards, Counting himself more honoured in dispensing his gifts to man by man, than if he did it by his owne immediate hands.

2. Reas. Secondly that he might have the more occasion to manifest the work of his Spirit; first upon the wicked in moderating and restraining them: see that the riche and mighty should not eate upp the poore nor the poore and dispens rise upp against and shake off there yoke. Secondly In the regenerate, in exercising his graces in them, as in the grate ones, their love, mercy, gentleness, temperance &c., in the poore and inferior sort, their faith, patience, obedience etc.

3 Ren. Thirdly, that every man might have need of others, and from hence they might be all knitt more nearly together in the Bonds of brotherly affection. From hence it appears plainly that noe man is made more honourable than another or more wealthy etc., out of any particular and singular respect to himself, but for the glory of his creator and the common good of the creature, man. . . . All men being thus (by divine providence) ranked into two sorts, riche and poore; under the first are comprehended all such as are able to live comfortably by their own means dueley improved; and all others are poore according to the former distribution. There are two rules whereby we are to walk one towards another: Justice and Mercy. . . . There is likewise a double Lawe by which wee are regulated in our conversation towards another; in both the former respects, the lawe of nature and the lawe of grace, or the morall lawe or the lawe of the gospel. . . . By the first of these lawes man as he was enabled soe withall is commanded to love his neighbour as himself. Upon this ground stands all the precepts of the morall lawe, which concerns our dealings with men. To apply this to the works of mercy; this lawe requires two things. First that every man afford his help to another in every want or distresse. Secondly, that hee performe this out of the same affection which makes him carefull of his owne goods, according to that of our Savior, (Math.) Whatsoever ye would that men should do to you. . . .

This lawe of the Gospel propounds likewise a difference of seasons and occasions. There is a time when a christian must sell all and give to the poor, as they did in the Apostles times. There is a time also when christians (though they give not all yet) must give beyond their ability, as they of Macedonia, Cor. 2, 6. Likewise community of perills calls for extraordinary liberality, and soe doth community in some speciall service for the churche. Lastly, when there is no other means whereby our christian brother may be relieved in his distress, we must help him beyond our ability rather than tempt God in putting him upon help by miraculous or extraordinary meanes. . . .

[Concerning] the affection from which [the] exercise of mercy must arise, the Apostle tells us that this love is the fullfilling of the lawe . . . the way to drawe men to the workes of mercy, is not by force of Argument from the goodness or necessity of the worke; for though this cause may enforce, a rationall minde to some present act of mercy, as is frequent in experience, yet it cannot worshe such a habit in a soule, as shall make it prompt upon all occasions to produce the same effect, but by framinge these affections of love in the hearte which will as naturally bring forth the other, as any cause doth produce the effect.

The definition which the Scripture gives us of love is this. Love is the bond of perfection, first it is a bond or ligament. Secondly it makes the worke perfect. There is noe body but consists of partes and that which knitts these partes together, gives the body its perfection, because it makes eache parte soe contiguous to others as thereby they doe mutually participate with each other, both in strengthe and infirmity, in pleasure and paine. To instance in the most perfect of all bodies; Christ and his Church make one body; the several partes of this body considered a parte before they were united, were as disproportionate and as much disordering as soe many contrary qualitie or elements, but when Christ
comes, and by his spirit and love knits all these partes to himselfe and each to
other, it is become the most perfect and best proportioned body in the world....

From hence we may frame these conclusions. First of all, true Christians are
of one body in Christ. ... Ye are the body of Christ and members of their parte.
All the partes of this body being thus united are made soe contiguous in a speci-
all relation as they must needs partake of each other's strength and infirmity;
joy and sorrowe, weale and woe. ... If one member suffers, all suffer with it, if
one be in honor, all rejoice with it. Secondly. The ligaments of this body which
knitt together are love. Thirdly. Noe body can be perfect which wants its proper
ligament. ... This sensibleness and sympathy of each other's conditions will nec-
essarily infuse into each parte a native desire and endeavore, to strengthen,
defend, preserve and comfort the other....

The next consideration is how this love comes to be wrought. Adam in his
first estate was a perfect modell of mankinde in all their generations, and in him
this love was perfected in regard of the habit. But Adam, rent himselfe from his
Creator, rent all his posterity alsoe one from another; whence it comes that every
man is borne with this principle in him to love and seeke himselfe onely, and
thus a man continueth till Christ comes and takes possession of the soule and
infuseth another principle, love to God and our brother, and this latter having
continuall supply from Christ, as the head and roote by which he is united, gets
the predomining in the soule, soe by little and little expells the former. ... Now
when this qualitie is thus formed in the soules of men, it workes like the Spirit
upon the die bones. ... It gathers together the scattered bones, or perfect old
man Adam, and knitts them into one body againe in Christ, whereby a man is
become againe a living soule.

The third consideration is concerning the exercise of this love. ... wee must
take in our way that maxime of philosophy. Simile simili gaudet, or like will to
like. ... This is the cause why the Lord loves the creature, soe farre as it hath any
of his Image in it; he loves his elect because they are like himselfe, he beholds
them in his beloved sonne. So a mother loves her childe, because shee thoroughly
conceives a resemblance of herselfe in it. Thus it is betweene the members of
Christ; each discernes, by the worke of the Spirit, his owne Image and resem-
bliance in another, and therefore cannot but love him as he loves himselfe....

2nly. In regard of the pleasure and content that the exercise of loue carres
with it, as wee may see in the natural body. ... Soe is it in all the labour of love
among Christians. The partie loving, reapes love again ... which the soule cov-
etts more then all the wealthie in the world. ... Nothing yeildes more pleasure
and content to the soule then when it findes that which it may love fervently; for
to love and live beloved is the soule's paradise both here and in heaven. In the
State of wedlock there be many comforts to leare out of the troubles of that
Condition; but let such as have tryed the most, say if there be any sweetines in
that Condition comparable to the exercise of mutuall love....

It rests now to make some application of this discourse. ... Herein are [four]
things to be propounded; first the persons, secondly the worke, thirdly the end,
fourthly the meanes.
First. For the persons. Wee are a company professing ourselves fellow members of Christ, in which respect onely though wee were absent from each other many miles, and had our employments as farre distant, yet wee ought to account ourselves knit together by this bond of love, and, live in the exercise of it, if wee would have comforte of our being in Christ. . . . Secondly for the worke wee have in hand. It is by a mutuall consent, through a speciall overvaluing providence and a more than an ordinary approbation of the Churches of Christ, to seeke out a place of cohabitation and Consorteshipp under a due forme of Government both civill and ecclesiasticall. In such cases as this, the care of the publique must oversway all private respects, by which, not only conscience, but meare civill policy, dothe binde us. For it is a true rule that particular Estates cannot subsist in the ruin of the publique. Thirdly the end is to improve our lives to doe more service to the Lord; the comforte and encrease of the body of Christe, whereof we are members; that ourselves and posterity may be the better preserved from the common corruptions of this evill world, to serve the Lord and worke out our Salvation under the power and purity of his holy ordinances. Fourthly for the meanes whereby this must be effected. They are twofold, a conformity with the worke and end wee aime at. These wee see are extraordinary, therefore wee must not content ourselves with usauld ordinary meanes. Whatesoeuer wee did, or ought to have, done, when wee lived in England, the same must wee doe, and more allsoe, where wee goe. That which the most in theire churches maintaine as trueth in profession onely, wee must bring into familiar and constant practise; as in this duty of love, wee must love brotherly without dissimilation, wee must love one another with a pure hearte fervently. Wee must beare one anothers burden. We must not looke onely on our owne things, but allsoe on the things of our brethren. Neither must wee thinke that the Lord will beare with such failings at our hands as he dothe from those among whom wee have lived; and that for these 3 Reasons: 1. In regard of the more neare bond of mariaghe between him and us, wherein hee hath taken us to be his, after a most strickt and peculiar manner, which will make them the more jealous of our love and obedience. Soe he tells the people of Israel, you onely have I knowne of all the families of the Earthe, therefore will I punishe you for your Transgressions. Secondly, because the Lord will be sanctified in them that come neare him. We know that there were many that corrupted the service of the Lord; some setting upp altars before his owne; others offering both strange fire and strange sacrifices allsoe. . . . Thirdly when God gives a speciall commission he lookes to have it strictly observed in every article. . . . Thus stands the cause betweene God and us. We are entered into Covenant with Him for this worke. Wee have taken out a commission. The Lord hath given us leave to drawe our own articles. Wee have professed to enterprise these and those accounts, upon these and those ends. Wee have hereupon besought Him of favour and blessing. Now if the Lord shall please to heare us, and bring us in peace to the place we desire, then hath hee ratified this covenant and sealed our Commission, and will expect a strict performance of the articles contained in it; but if wee shall neglect the observation of these articles which are the ends wee have propounded, and, dissembling with our God, shall fail to embrace this present world and prosecute our carnall intentions, seeking greate
things for ourselves and our posterity, the Lord will surely breake out in wraethe against us; be revenged of such a [sinful] people and make us knowe the price of the breache of such a covenant.

Now the onely way to avoyde this shipwrecke, and to provide for our posterity, is to followe the counsell of Micah, to doe justly, to love mercy, to walk humbly with our God. For this end, wee must be knitt together, in this worke, as one man. Wee must entertaine each other in brotherly affection. Wee must be willing to abridge ourselfes of our superfluities, for the supply of other's necessities. Wee must uphold a familiar commerce together in all meekeness, gentlenes[s], patience and liberality. Wee must delight in each other; make other's conditions our owne; rejoice together, mourne together, labour and suffer together, allways haveing before our eyes our commission and community in the worke, as members of the same body. Soe shall wee keepe the unitie of the spirit in the bond of peace. The Lord will be our God, and delight to dwell among us, as his owne people, and will command a blessing upon us in all our wayes. Soe that wee shall see much more of his wisdom, power, goodness and trueth, than formerly wee have been acquainted with. Wee shall finde that the God of Israel is among us, when ten of us shall be able to resist a thousand of our enemies; when hee shall make us a prayse and glory that men shall say of succeeding plantations, "the Lord make it likely that of New England." For wee must consider that wee shall be as a city upon a hill. The eyes of all people are upon us. Soe that if wee shall deale falsely with our God in this worke wee have undertaken, and soe cause him to withdrowe his present help from us, wee shall be made a story and a by-word through the world. Wee shall open the mouthes of enemies to speake evil of the wayes of God, and all professors for God's sake. Wee shall shame the faces of many of God's worthy servants, and cause their prayers to be turned into curses upon us till wee be consumed out of the good land whither wee are a going.

I shall shutt upp this discourse with that exhortation of Moses, that faithfull servant of the Lord, in his last farewell to Israel, Deut. 30. Beloved there is now sett before us life and good, Death and evil, in that wee are commanded this day to love the Lord our God, and to love one another, to walke in his wayes and to keepe his Commandements and his Ordinance and his lawes, and the articles of our Covenant with him, that wee may live and be multiplied, and that the Lord our God may blesse us in the land whither wee goe to possess it. But if our heartes shall turne away, soo that wee will not obey, but shall be seduced, and worshipp and serve other Gods, our pleasure and profitts, and serve them; it is propounded unto us this day, wee shall surely perishe out of the good land whither wee passe over this vast sea to possess it;

Therefore lett us choose life,
that wee, and our seede,
may live, by obeying His
voice, and cleaueing to Him,
for Hee is our life and
our prosperity.
READING AND DISCUSSION QUESTIONS

1. Winthrop uses the metaphor of a "body" to describe the Puritan community he envisions for Massachusetts Bay. What was his vision for this "body"?

2. Compare the values expressed here with your own. What value do you think Winthrop might have placed on such contemporary "American" values as individualism and privacy?

2-3  |  The Limits of the Puritan Community

The Trial of Anne Hutchinson (1637)

The Christian charity that John Winthrop (Document 2-2) extolled did not extend to all members of the new colonial society. Anne Hutchinson (1591–1643) arrived in the Massachusetts Bay Colony in 1634 and within a few years was embroiled in a religious and political crisis. Like all Calvinists, Hutchinson believed that God's grace alone could save one's soul and that individuals could not earn their way to heaven through good deeds. While some ministers had accepted outward signs of grace as evidence of salvation, assuming that only the elect could lead saintly lives, Hutchinson rejected this. When she began holding prayer meetings and questioning the doctrines of some Bay Colony ministers, Hutchinson was put on trial and eventually banished. This selection comes from the transcript of Hutchinson's trial. The governor who led the questioning is Winthrop.

Mr. Winthrop, governor. Mrs Hutchinson, you are called here as one of those that have troubled the peace of the commonwealth and the churches here; you are known to be a woman that hath had a great share in the promoting and divulging of those opinions that are the cause of this trouble . . . you have maintained a meeting and an assembly in your house that hath been condemned by the general assembly as a thing not tolerable nor comely in the sight of God nor fitting for your sex, and notwithstanding that was cried down you have continued the same. Therefore we have thought good to send for you to understand how things are, that if you be in an erroneous way we may reduce you that so you may become a profitable member here among us, otherwise if you be obstinate in your course that then the court may take such course that you may trouble us no further. Therefore I would intreat you to express whether you do not hold and assent in practice to those opinions and factions that have been handled in court already, that is to say, whether you do not justify Mr. Wheelwright's sermon and the petition.

Mrs. Hutchinson. I am called here to answer before you but I hear no things laid to my charge.

Gov. I have told you some already and more I can tell you.

Mrs. H. Name one, Sir.